



<http://ntrp16.org/>

**North Texas Regional P-16 Council**

**Meeting Minutes**

**April 27, 2021**

**9:00 am – 12:00 pm**

**ATTENDEES**

Jill Adams, Patonia Bell, Leslie Birdow, Annette Duvall, Kristyn Edney, Tracey Fleniken, Tammy Galloway, Robert Gillies, Tiffany Gilmore, Mary Harris, Christine Hubbard, Jason Hudson, Jean Keller, Barbara Lerner, Karrabi Malin, Raul Martinez, Mike Mattingly, Anna Mays, Cornelia McCowan, Bobby Morris, Renee Parker, Theresa Paschall, Quortina Phipps, Patsy Robles-Goodwin, Usamah Muhammad-Rodgers, Ray de los Santos, Richard Vela, Rosalyn Walker, and Karen Zeske

**Guests:**

Rebecca Fredrickson, TWU; Danielle Hernandez, Dallas ISD

**A. Greetings**

Jean Keller welcomed all to the North Texas Regional P-16 Council Meeting and thanked them for their commitment to students' educational access and success.

**B. Approval of Minutes**

December 1, 2020, meeting minutes were reviewed. Christine Hubbard moved to approve; Barbara Lerner seconded; and they were approved as written.

**C. Discussion of Regional Data**

Raul Martinez, Collin College, shared information on the landscape of dual credit enrollment, course enrollment, and pass/fail ratios for 2015-2021 in Collin, Tarrant County, and Dallas Colleges. He highlighted the 2015 passage of TX HB505, which prohibited limitation of the number of dual credit courses or hours in which a student may enroll while in high school or the number of dual credit courses or hours in which a student may enroll each semester or academic year.

Dual credit numbers have increased across the state of Texas. Comparing Collin, Tarrant and Dallas Colleges, Dallas has always had larger enrollment in dual credit.

Pass/Fail numbers are currently available only for Fall, 2020-21. Collin College has one P-Tech; however, they have Early Collegiate Academy models that mirror P-Techs. These schools decided not to go through the TEA designation process, and this has worked for them. An example is Plano Health Science Academy, which uses a P-Tech model in partnership with Plano ISD. Having the partnerships and relationships encourages student enrollment. High schools want to offer many options for students such as IB, AP and dual credit. These can co-exist and benefit various students.

Richard Vela reported TCCD has also experienced steady growth in dual credit. TCCD Institutional Research separates traditional dual credit from TEA partnerships data. Partnerships include ECHS, P-Techs, and T-STEM academies. Their pass rate has stayed consistent at 92-93% although there was a slight dip attributed to the COVID-19 pandemic. TCCD currently has 17 ECHS and P-Techs recognized by TEA. In the next academic year, they will grow to 23. In 2022-23, they are projected to reach 28.

Anna Mays, Dallas College, shared that passing rates are grades A through C for Dallas College. In terms of the growth of dual credit, between 2015-16 and 2019-20, Dallas College doubled its dual credit enrollment. The trend is that approximately 40% of the enrollment is the College and Career Readiness model schools, P-Tech, T-STEM, and ECHS rather than comprehensive dual credit. Dallas College has 77 College and Career Readiness Model Schools (CCRMS), including P-Tech and ECHS, as well as some T-STEM academies. Some of their high schools are re-evaluating their pathway structures with respect to student' interests. They also use labor market information to determine what is most appropriate for the pathways and then work in partnership with school districts.

Raul Martinez shared that Collin College's increase in dual credit. Collin College waives their tuition for students on free and reduced lunch. Raul noted, there may be some stigma associated with the fee waiver based on this criterion. Collin College has been encouraging all students to take advantage of dual credit courses. This past year, larger numbers of students failed or withdrew from dual credit courses. This may have been due to lack of testing and other factors.

Richard Vela pointed out some students may have dropped dual credit courses due to lower performance this year which lowered TCCD's enrollments. A contributor to higher enrollments was TCCD's TEA's P-Techs. As the ISDs work with both higher education and industry partners, students increased their clarity of purpose and employment opportunities.

Anna Mays, Dallas College, stated they had a success rate drop in the Fall from 81.3% to 72%. A through C is considered passing, and Dallas College had an

increased withdrawal rate. Many students did not have access to broadband; they had family situations where they had to go to work; and multiple other factors that influenced successful completion. Many students were not prepared for the online classes. Dallas College faculty monitored student progress and attendance, and that is continuing this semester to support student success. Industry partners are interested in supporting the students and have provided internships and employment information for the graduating seniors. Dallas College career services and workforce areas are working on a plan for employment of graduating seniors. Dallas ISD has seen twice the number of graduates as last year, which is good.

Raul Martinez said COVID-19 has encouraged all to question whether current practices support student success. During COVID-19, Collin College set up an early alert system to support students.

Rosalyn Walker described Tarrant County College District's early alert system and supplemental instruction that supports a classroom virtually, as well as tutoring services to help students navigate the technology and content being delivered. Most students had an option of classes being offered as asynchronous or synchronous instruction, which helped the students because many had to work or become teachers of their children or siblings. During the onset of COVID-19, the TCCD Academic Affairs Department deans and faculty got together and developed some alternative TSIA, looking at a holistic approach, and these actions are in place today. They also purchased a monthly contract for proctoring services. Their high school partners, along with traditional students, can take the TSIA virtually with a proctor.

Anna Mays said that Dallas College is also funding proctor testing through Examany. However, the issue with Examany is that a student must have a laptop and a webcam, and many students do not have this equipment. Dallas College is now providing TSIA by appointment on their campuses. Their high school partners are administering the TSIA because they have purchased their own units and are administrators. Supporting tuition scholarships and waivers are a critical because of the economic impact of the pandemic. THECB has done several studies, and Dallas College has done internal studies, on how graduation rates of students who participate in dual credit or get a certificate or degree are impacting our local region and are hoping this will encourage financial support. Dallas College Board approved over \$16 million in tuition scholarships last year and will probably increase these amounts with expand dual credit. Not every college or university can afford to do that, but it makes a difference in terms of level of participation.

Barbara Lerner asked the group whether now that there are proportionately more P-Techs available to students, if the three colleges could give some information comparing the success rates. How many students are moving toward completion of

the associate degrees? How many are transferring to four-year colleges? Are there difference between the P-Tech, ECHS, and dual credit students?

Anna, Dallas College, said the first graduating class of P-Tech was last year. There is limited data on their employment and transfer rates because they got out of high school during COVID. Many who were originally planning employment transferred because the type of in-person job situations anticipated were not available. They are going to track this for the coming year and have some basic information, although they do not think this is reflective of success, but rather reflective of the condition of the environment and the economy. Dallas ISD was their first P-Tech cohort, with a 72% graduation rate of associate degrees, which is phenomenal. The average across the nation is about 45%. ECHSs traditionally have had relatively higher graduation rates, but they tend to be focused on transfer. Dallas College is looking at all pathways to determine the options for students.

Richard shared that TCCD's P-Techs are young. They do not have data yet. They discuss with ISD partners the importance of students and parents understanding pathways and the importance of building the crosswalks collaboratively. The discussion takes place with the ISD and with the higher education partners. They want to make sure this is all in the interest of the student. Offerings are strategically planned so they do not run the risk of excessive hours. If the P-Tech crosswalk is more suited to a technical degree or certificate, they want the student to know transfer implications

#### **D. Panel: PK-16 Collection, Interpretation & Understanding**

##### **a. Panelists:**

- i. Krystal Garza, Statewide Coordinator of College and Career Readiness School Models (CCRMS), TEA
- ii. Luis Martinez, Data Training Specialist, Strategic Planning and Funding, THECB

Krystal stated she anticipates increases in dual credit in the next year or two. The North Texas Region will see the differences by targeting ECHS, P-Tech, and T-STEM models. There are currently 212 districts in this region and 113 campuses are involved collectively with one of these models, compared to Region One with 74 campuses. In terms of data, they are working on 2019-2020 output. The full-scale outcomes will be available in August 2021.

Luis shared the most recent data on dual credit pass rates for students in ISDs in ESC 11 with passing grades of A, B or C or no C or better. The pass rates are the same as in previous years with some ups and downs in different subject areas. For example, Chemistry was

a little down, but Mathematics pass rates were a little higher. He also shared dual credit pass rates, by ethnicity. The numbers shown were combined for ESC 11 and then broken down by district. An example showed 300,000 students in dual credit with a pass rate of 88%.

Luis will provide data when available for the Community College Districts 8, 9, 10, 11 and 14 and for North Texas ESC Regions 10 and 11 (roughly comparable to the THECB Metroplex Region), with statewide comparison.

Krystal shared information student enrollment in CCRSM programs for 2018-19, 2019-20, and 2020-21. The 2018-19 year was the first official year of P-Tech; however, campuses like some in Dallas ISD were using a P-Tech model with ICIA (Accounting) as well as CTE Dual Credit, which accounts for the baseline for these data. Enrollment does not necessarily mean enrollment at a higher education level, but enrollment in a student reporting system. They currently maintain three models over two years. Enrollment is aggregated by certain demographics. As reported in the past, the data from P-Tech to ECHS to T-STEM, show the new model P-Tech has higher success in recruiting students who are at risk or economically disadvantaged. This could be because they are newer models, at newer campuses, and depend on different patterns for recruiting than were used for ECHS. P-Techs are active in the North Texas region. El Paso is having a bit of a boom, as is Houston. P-Tech is not catching on in South Texas, which is a great example of traditions they do not necessarily see a need to change. The CCRSM Enrollment, 2020-2021, shows ECHS with 65,169 students, T-STEM with 53,995 students, and P-Tech with 13,376 students. TEA is not encouraging model shifting, unless the program is ready to handle all the other elements, such as workforce and work-based learning.

## **E. Discussion, Reflections and Actions**

Christine Hubbard led the Council's follow-up discussion.

### **There is leadership turnover in our Early College High Schools. What's going on, and how might it affect our students?**

Krystal said that from a regional perspective, South Texas does not have a leadership turnover problem. A lot of administrators tend to stay, which is good and bad, because it means things do not change a lot. The relationships are strong. In the North Texas Region; relationship building is strong, as well despite turnover at the campus

level. Some districts must pull out from models because a principal has left who was the champion of that model. In terms of the technicality of it, for the CCRSM programs, if you stop being a P-tech, ECHS, or T-STEM for one year, the district still must honor the plan of students who were on that campus and promised the outcomes until they graduate. That gets tricky for MOUs, because MOUs can be yearly or bi-yearly depending on the IHE partnership. TEA provides technical support from Educate Texas, which provides three to four coaching visits. There is also a New Leaders Forum in July and a coach is assigned to each campus.

**What would you recommend as the best option, ECHS, P-Tech, or T-STEM? What do you think?**

Krystal responded that ECHS works in South Texas because there is a strong academic tradition with a strong pathway that does not have immediate ties to industry. P-Techs

work in the north Texas region because there is so much business and industry, but when you are competing for the attention of one business and industry partner with various campuses competition can occur. All models should be thinking about middle schoolers. Due to the feeder patterns, you can know where the students are likely come from and need to build these relationships to assure a program that has a structure you can sustain.

Anna, Dallas College, shared they have learned it is important to determine which pathway is appropriate to the student population. Whether it is Comprehensive Dual Credit, T-STEM, P-Tech, or ECHS, it is challenging to structure programs and to keep students on track. The leadership is critical. They see differences in student performance and buy in and relationships among faculty based upon the leadership of a high school. They have conversations with high school partners, particularly since they have consolidated, as to what is the best model for the high school and what can be sustained. They researched work at south Texas colleges before starting their ECHS and P-Tech.

Annette Duvall said the coaching for P-TECH has been invaluable for Crowley ISD. They have had a fantastic experience in the planning

year for their P-Tech. They have an existing ECHS. Their coaching on P-Tech brought together, their higher education partner, TCCD, with their industry partners. The coach has provided input on how they can all work together for desired outcomes.

**Based on the discussion today, what other ideas do you have about how we can best serve our students in the metroplex area?**

Krystal replied, “For your P-Tech, what is next in work-based learning?” For your ECHS and T-STEM, are the pathways and articulation agreements correct? Correct in the moment does not mean correct next year or the following year; you must keep working at it.

In addition to quantitative data, qualitative data provides added insight. Data alone is not the answer. Getting insights from students, counselors, and others can provide information on what makes a school successful and where it struggles. You want to identify the pain points and start discussions that blend the quantitative data with observations that lead to richer conversations.

Senate Bill 1963, as Senator West moves it forward, will require a transfer report card that holds institutions accountable. Understanding the complications and the implications of all of these programs and how the courses that students take, for example, within a P-Tech or non-academic pathway will impact the transfer report card because students will have taken a number of classes that simply will not apply, given the rules and regulations that we are under unless they are in a pathway ahead of time, and we know how to build that pathway and make them applicable. A transfer report card, depending on the institution, might de-incentivize outcomes in the long run, between a partner and a school district, because of the matriculation. The data itself is wonderful, but data in isolation can sometimes be misleading without these conversations.

Jean Keller shared that one of the things that makes our region unique is multiple districts affiliated with multiple two-year four-year higher education institutions; thus, pathways are important.

**F. Committee Reports**

- a. Communications, Networking & Social Media –
- b. Leadership & Sustainability –
- c. Professional Development –
- d. Research, Assessment & Accountability –

**G. Updates and Information Sharing**

**H. Adjournment**

Please mark your calendar!

2021-2022 NTRP-16 Council Meeting Dates and Programs

9:00 AM – 12:00 PM

Date	Place	Host	Topics	Program Facilitator
To be announced	Virtual	Rosalyn Walker	Equity and Social Justice	Christine Hubbard